

BRITISH COLUMBIA

Electoral Boundaries Commission

PRELIMINARY REPORT

August 15, 2007

COVER PHOTO LISTING

Top row – left to right

Kinney Lake, Mount Robson Provincial Park, B.C.
Richmond, B.C.
Coastal B.C.
Parliament Buildings, Victoria, B.C.

Second row – left to right

Coastal B.C.
Coquihalla Highway, B.C.
Unknown neighbourhood
Saanich Inlet, Vancouver Island, B.C.

Third row – left to right

Mount Assiniboine Lodge, B.C.
Stanley Park, Vancouver, B.C.
Dawson Creek, B.C.
Along the Fraser River, B.C.

Bottom row – left to right

Vaseux Lake, B.C.
Vancouver, B.C.
Nelson, B.C.
Unknown B.C. valley

Vaseux Lake photo: Gunter Marx Stock Photos

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication Data
British Columbia. Electoral Boundaries Commission.
Preliminary report to the Legislative Assembly of British Columbia

ISBN 0-7726-5632-0
ISBN 978-0-7726-5632-2

1. British Columbia. Legislative Assembly – Election Districts – Planning. 2. British Columbia. Electoral Boundaries Commission. 3. Election districts – British Columbia – Planning. 4. Election districts – British Columbia. 5. Redistribution (Election law) – British Columbia. I. Title. II. Title: Electoral Boundaries Commission preliminary report to the Legislative Assembly of British Columbia.

JL433.B74 2007 328.711'07345 C2006-960186-0

© 2007

British Columbia Electoral Boundaries Commission



British Columbia
Electoral Boundaries Commission

August 15, 2007

The Honourable Bill Barisoff
Speaker of the Legislative Assembly of British Columbia
Room 207
Parliament Buildings
Victoria, British Columbia
V8V 1X4

Honourable Speaker:

Preliminary Report of the British Columbia Electoral Boundaries Commission

We are pleased to submit our Preliminary Report, as required by section 10(1) of the *Electoral Boundaries Commission Act*, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 107, as amended by section 4(3)(a) of the *Electoral Boundaries Commission Amendment Act, 2005*, S.B.C. 2005, c. 30.

Yours very truly,

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Bruce Cohen".

The Hon. Mr. Justice Bruce I. Cohen
Commission Chair

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Stewart Ladyman".

Stewart Ladyman
Commissioner

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Harry Neufeld".

Harry Neufeld
Chief Electoral Officer for British Columbia
Commissioner



Table of contents

Letter of transmittal

1

PART 1 – EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1

2

PART 2 – THE ROLE OF THE COMMISSION

9

A. Introduction

10

1. The Electoral Boundaries Commission’s task 10
2. A new commission after every second provincial election 11
3. The dual mandate 11
 - a. The current electoral system 11
 - b. The proposed BC-STV electoral system 12
4. The purpose of this Preliminary Report 13

B. The Commission

13

1. Our team 13
 - a. The commissioners 13
 - b. Staff 14
 - c. Counsel 14
 - d. External technical staff 14
2. Our activities 15
3. Our consultations with the public 16
 - a. Process 16
 - b. Where we went 17
 - c. What we heard 17
 - d. How we considered people’s views and suggestions in our proposals 19
4. Our goals: independence, transparency and accessibility 19

3	PART 3 – THE HISTORY OF SETTING ELECTORAL BOUNDARIES FOR BRITISH COLUMBIA’S LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY	21
	<i>A. Introduction</i>	22
	<i>B. The Angus Commission (1966)</i>	23
	<i>C. The Norris Commission (1975)</i>	24
	<i>D. The Eckardt Commission (1978)</i>	24
	<i>E. The Warren Commission (1982)</i>	25
	<i>F. The McAdam Commission (1984)</i>	27
	<i>G. The Fisher Commission (1988)</i>	28
	<i>H. The Wood Commission (1999)</i>	30
4	PART 4 – THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK	33
	<i>A. British Columbia Legislation</i>	34
	1. The current single member plurality (SMP) system	34
	a. The area, boundaries and names of the electoral districts	35
	b. Increasing the number of electoral districts	35
	2. The proposed single transferable vote (BC-STV) system	35
	3. Our commission only proposes	36
	<i>B. Legislation in Other Canadian Jurisdictions</i>	36
	<i>C. Court Decisions</i>	36
	1. The Supreme Court of Canada’s interpretation of the right to vote	36
	2. Applying the Supreme Court of Canada’s interpretation provincially	39
	<i>D. Summary of Legal Principles Governing Us</i>	39
5	PART 5 – “EFFECTIVE REPRESENTATION” AND “VERY SPECIAL CIRCUMSTANCES”	41
	<i>A. Our Understanding of “Effective Representation”</i>	42
	<i>B. Our Approach to “Very Special Circumstances”</i>	43
6	PART 6 – DETERMINING ELECTORAL DISTRICT POPULATIONS	47
	<i>A. Calculating the Provincial Electoral Quotient</i>	48
	1. Census data	49
	2. Voter count data	49
	<i>B. The Changing Face of British Columbia</i>	50

7	PART 7 – REGIONAL GROUPINGS	51
	<i>A. British Columbia’s Regions</i>	<i>52</i>
	<i>B. Previous Commissions’ Regions</i>	<i>53</i>
	<i>C. Our Regional Groupings</i>	<i>54</i>
8	PART 8 – ELECTORAL DISTRICTS AND MLAs	57
	<i>A. Legislation</i>	<i>58</i>
	<i>B. History</i>	<i>59</i>
	<i>C. What People Told Us</i>	<i>60</i>
	<i>D. How B.C. Compares to Other Provinces and Territories</i>	<i>60</i>
	<i>E. Discussion</i>	<i>61</i>
9	PART 9 – PROPOSED SINGLE MEMBER PLURALITY BOUNDARIES	63
	<i>A. A Description of the SMP Electoral System</i>	<i>64</i>
	<i>B. The Process</i>	<i>64</i>
	1. The steps we went through in developing our proposed SMP electoral districts	64
	2. Using updated population projections	67
	<i>C. The North</i>	<i>68</i>
	1. The evolution of the North’s electoral districts	68
	2. Our analysis of the North’s electoral districts	76
	a. The West	77
	b. The Peace	78
	c. The Central North	80
	3. “Protecting northern representation”	82
	4. Conclusion	84
	<i>D. The Cariboo-Thompson</i>	<i>95</i>
	1. The evolution of the Cariboo-Thompson electoral districts	95
	2. Our analysis of the Cariboo-Thompson electoral districts	102
	3. Conclusion	106
	<i>E. The Okanagan</i>	<i>114</i>
	1. Evolution of the Okanagan electoral districts	114
	2. Our analysis of the Okanagan electoral districts	121
	3. Conclusion	123

<i>F. The Columbia-Kootenay</i>	133
1. Evolution of the Columbia-Kootenay electoral districts	133
2. Our analysis of the Columbia-Kootenay electoral districts	141
3. Conclusion	142
<i>G. The Fraser Valley</i>	149
1. Evolution of the Fraser Valley electoral districts north of the river	149
2. Evolution of the Fraser Valley electoral districts south of the river	157
3. Our analysis of the Fraser Valley electoral districts	165
4. Conclusion	168
<i>H. The Tri-Cities Area</i>	181
1. Evolution of the Tri-Cities electoral districts	181
2. Our analysis of the Tri-Cities electoral districts	188
3. Conclusion	189
<i>I. Surrey</i>	196
1. Evolution of Surrey's electoral districts	196
2. Our analysis of Surrey's electoral districts	204
3. Conclusion	205
<i>J. Richmond and Delta</i>	216
1. Evolution of the Richmond and Delta electoral districts	216
2. Our analysis of the Richmond and Delta electoral districts	222
3. Conclusion	223
<i>K. Burnaby and New Westminster</i>	231
1. Evolution of the Burnaby and New Westminster electoral districts	231
2. Our analysis of the Burnaby and New Westminster electoral districts	238
3. Conclusion	239
<i>L. Vancouver</i>	247
1. Evolution of Vancouver's electoral districts	247
2. Our analysis of Vancouver's electoral districts	256
3. Conclusion	258
<i>M. The North Shore</i>	273
1. Evolution of the North Shore electoral districts	274
2. Our analysis of the North Shore electoral districts	280
3. Conclusion	281
<i>N. Vancouver Island and South Coast</i>	288
1. Evolution of the Vancouver Island and South Coast electoral districts	288
2. Our analysis of the Vancouver Island and South Coast electoral districts	297
3. Conclusion	301

PART 10 – PROPOSED BC-STV ELECTORAL SYSTEM BOUNDARIES	319
<i>A. A Description of the Proposed BC-STV Electoral System</i>	320
1. Citizens’ Assembly on Electoral Reform	320
2. Key elements of the proposed BC-STV electoral system	320
3. 2005 referendum on the proposed BC-STV electoral system	321
4. The role of this Electoral Boundaries Commission	322
5. To learn more about BC-STV	323
<i>B. Combining SMP Electoral Districts to Create BC-STV Electoral Districts</i>	323
<i>C. Reasons for Our Proposed District Magnitudes</i>	324
<i>D. Our Proposals for BC-STV Electoral Boundaries</i>	326
1. The North	326
2. The Cariboo-Thompson	327
3. The Okanagan	327
4. The Columbia-Kootenay	328
5. The Fraser Valley	328
6. Tri-Cities	329
7. Surrey	329
8. Richmond and Delta	330
9. Burnaby and New Westminster	330
10. Vancouver	330
11. North Shore	331
12. Vancouver Island and South Coast	331

PART 11 – LOOKING AHEAD	353
<i>A. Delivery of this Preliminary Report</i>	354
<i>B. Public Hearings</i>	354
<i>C. Dates and Locations of Our Public Hearings</i>	354
<i>D. Registration for Presenters</i>	355
<i>E. Written Submissions</i>	355
<i>F. The Commission’s Final Report</i>	355
<i>G. The Role of the Legislative Assembly</i>	356

12 PART 12 – DESCRIPTIONS OF PROPOSED ELECTORAL BOUNDARIES 357

13 PART 13 – ADDITIONAL INFORMATION 361

- List of Maps and Tables* 362 – 373
- Appendices* 374 – 452
- List of Staff and Suppliers* 453